

IEEE 802.1 Interim Meeting

Budapest, Hungary, May 2016

802.1 Meeting Minutes – 23-26 May, 2016

Attendees

<i>Last Name</i>	<i>First Name</i>	<i>Middle Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
Abt	Werner		HMS
Assmann	Ralf		Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
Baek	SeoYoung		LG Electronics
Bao	Shenghua		Huawei
Bierschenk	Jens		Robert Bosch GmbH
Bjornstad	Steinar		TransPacket
Boiger	Christian		b-plus GmbH
Bruckman	Leon		IP Light
Chen	David		NSN, Inc.
Chen	Feng		Siemens AG
Crupnicoff	Diego		Mellanox Technologies
Cummings	Rodney		National Instruments Corporation
DeLaOlivaDelgado	Antonio		Universidad Carlos III Madrid
Ellegaard	Lars		Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation
Farkas	Janos		Ericsson
Finn	Norman		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Gaal	Geza		Ericsson AB
Garner	Geoffrey		Broadcom Corporation
Geyer	Fabien		Airbus Group
Gray	Eric	W	Ericsson AB
Gunther	Craig		HARMAN International Industries, Incorporated
Gutierrez	Marina		TTTech Computertechnik AG
Haddock	Stephen		Stephen Haddock Consulting, LLC
Hantel	Mark		Rockwell Automation
Heise	Peter		Airbus Group
Henry	Jerome		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Holness	Marc		Ciena Corporation
Huang	Jing		Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

<i>Last Name</i>	<i>First Name</i>	<i>Middle Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
Hummen	Rene		Hirschmann Automation and Control, Inc.
Jeffree	Anthony		Broadcom, HP
Johas Teener	Michael		Broadcom Corporation
Kehrer	Stephan		Hirschmann Automation and Control, Inc.
Kim	Soyoung		LG Electronics
Klein	Olivier		Nokia
Klein	Philippe		Broadcom Corporation
Maiden	Richard		Intel Corporation
Mangin	Christophe		Mitsubishi Electric R&D Centre Europe (MERCE)
Mayer	Michael		Huawei Technologies Co. Canada Ltd
McIntosh	James		Microsemi Corporation
Messenger	John		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Moldovan	Istvan		Budapest University of Technology and Economics
Muench	Daniel		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Mustala	Tero		Nokia Networks
Pannell	Donald R		Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
Parsons	Glenn		Ericsson AB
Persson	Kent		Ericsson AB
Pohlman	Bjorn		Ericsson AB
Randall	Karen		NSA/IAD
Riegel	Maximilian		Nokia Networks
Rouyer	Jessy		Alcatel-Lucent
Ruffini	Stefano		Ericsson AB
Ryytty	Eero		Nokia
Sato	Toshifumi		NEC Corporation
Schmitt	Juergen		Siemens AG
Seaman	Michael		Individual
Specht	Johannes		University of Duisburg-Essen and General Motors Company
Thaler	Patricia		Broadcom Corporation
Unbehagen	Paul		Avaya Inc.
Varga	Balazs		Ericsson AB
Wang	Hao		Fujitsu Research & Development Center
Weber	Karl		Beckhoff
Weis	Brian		Cisco Systems, Inc.

<i>Last Name</i>	<i>First Name</i>	<i>Middle Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
Wilton	Robert		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Woods	Jordon		Innovasic, Inc.
Zebralla	Daniel		Continental Automotive GmbH

Task Group Minutes

TSN/Interworking Task Group minutes

Monday, 23 May

0800-1800, TSN/Interworking

János Farkas presented Administration and Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

Materials are available at:

<http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/materials.html>

János Farkas discussed logistics for the meeting venue:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/admin-Budapest-delegate-information-pack-0116-v07.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/admin-farkas-Budapest-0516-v01.pdf>

János Farkas presented the agenda.

Geoff Garner presented 802.1AS-Rev/D2.0 Comment Resolution:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/as-rev-drafts/d2/802-1AS-rev-d3-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/as-rev-drafts/d2/802-1AS-rev-d3-0-pdis.pdf>

Geoff Garner presented New State Machines and Specs for 802.1AS transport using FTM:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/as-garner-state-machines-specs-ftm.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented Resolving 802.1AS-rev (and 1588):

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/as-cummings-resolving-0516-v00.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented P802d WG ballot comment resolution:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/802-d-drafts/d0/802d-d0-2.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/802-d-drafts/d0/802d-D0-2-pdis-v1.pdf>

Tuesday, 24 May

1030-1800, TSN/Interworking

János Farkas reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

Norman Finn presented P802.1CB D2.3 WG ballot comment resolution

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cb-drafts/d2/802-1CB-d2-3.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cb-drafts/d2/802-1CB-d2-3-pdis-v02.pdf>

Marc Holness presented P802.1Qcp YANG:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-mholness-YANG-8021Qcp-Update-0516-v01.pdf>

Robert Wilton presented Interface VLAN YANG Data Models

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-yang-wilton-vlan-classification-0516-v01.pdf>

<https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-wilton-netmod-intf-vlan-yang/>

Wednesday, 25 May

0800-1800, TSN/Interworking

János Farkas reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

János Farkas presented AX-2014-Cor-1/D0.5 WG recirc ballot

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ax-2014-cor-1-drafts/d0/802-1ax-2014-cor-1-d0-5.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ax-2014-cor-1-drafts/d0/802-1ax-2014-cor-1-d0-5-pdis-v02.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented P802.1Qci WG ballot comment resolution

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ci-drafts/d1/802-1Qci-d1-1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ci-drafts/d1/802-1Qci-D1-1-pdis-v1.pdf>

Daniel Zebralla presented Blocking of misbehaving streams

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/ci-zebralla-block-streams-0516-v01.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented P802.1Qch TG ballot comment resolution

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ch-drafts/d0/802-1Qch-d0-1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ch-drafts/d0/802-1Qch-D0-1-pdis-v1.pdf>

Balázs Varga and Szilveszter Nádas presented Qcr - Value-based resource sharing framework

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cr-varga-srs-ppv-0526-v02.pdf>

Johannes Specht presented Qcr/ATS Updates

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/Qcr-specht-specification-mapping-proposal-0516-v01.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented P802.1Qcc D1.0 WG ballot comment resolution

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cc-drafts/d1/802-1Qcc-d1-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cc-drafts/d1/802-1Qcc-d1-0-pdis-v1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cc-cummings-d10-comments-intro-0516-v1.pdf>

Thursday, 26 May

0800-1800, TSN/Interworking

János Farkas reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

János Farkas presented CM Editor's report and D0.3

<http://iee802.org/1/files/private/cm-drafts/d0/802-1CM-d0-3.pdf>

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-farkas-editor-report-0516-v01.pdf>

The CPRI TWG presented CPRI TWG presentation

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-CPRI-functional-decomposition-requirements-0516-v01.pdf>

Stefano Ruffini presented CM synchronization considerations

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-ruffini-synchronization-considerations-0516-v01.pdf>

Balázs Varga, János Farkas presented CM loss considerations

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-varga-frame-loss-considerations-0516-v02.pdf>

Balázs Varga, János Farkas presented CM OAM considerations

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-varga-OAM-and-SLA-0516-v01.pdf>

János Farkas led CM discussion on way forward, next steps

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cm-farkas-editor-report-0516-v01.pdf#11>

Richard Maiden presented IEEE1904.3TF Update

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-roe-status-rm-ieee1904dot3-0516-v00.pdf>

James Huang presented New work related to OIF FlexE

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-flexe-huang-possible-work-0516-v01.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented Clarify MRP++ motion:

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-cummings-clarify-mrp-motion-0516-v00.pdf>

Juergen Schmitt presented MRP++/SRP++ for Stream Registration and Reservation:

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-schmitt-link-registration-0516-v01.pdf>

Feng Chen and Juergen Schmitt presented Linc-Local Registration Protocol PAR & CSD:

<http://iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-schmitt-lsp-0516-v01.docx>

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/new-xxx-msrp-csd-0516-v01.doc>

Rodney Cummings continued P802.1Qcc D1.0 WG ballot comment resolution:

<http://www.iee802.org/1/files/private/cc-drafts/d1/802-1Qcc-d1-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cc-drafts/d1/802-1Qcc-d1-0-pdis-v1.pdf>

<http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2016/cc-cummings-d10-comments-intro-0516-v1.pdf>

Maintenance Task Group Minutes

The minutes for the Interim meeting are incorporated in these minutes by reference and are available at:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/maint/2016-05-maintenance-meeting-v2.pdf>

Maintenance meeting minutes for prior meetings are available via:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/maint.html>

OmniRAN Task Group Minutes

The minutes for the May Interim meeting are incorporated in these minutes by reference and are available at:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/16/omniran-16-0034-00-00TG-may-2016-f2f-meeting-minutes.docx>

Amended meeting slides for that Interim meeting are available at:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/16/omniran-16-0028-01-00TG-may-2016-meeting-slides.pptx>

Current status of OmniRAN activities – including future meeting announcements, past meeting and conference call minutes – is available via a wiki located at:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/bp/StartPage>

DCB & Addressing Task Group Minutes

Tuesday, 24 May

0800-1800, DCB

Pat Thaler, DCB TG Chair, presented Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

There was no presentation on P802.1CQ so the meeting adjourned until 13:30.

1330-1600, P802c

Roger Marks presented P802c TG ballot comment resolution:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/802-c-drafts/d0/802c-d0-3.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/802-c-drafts/d0/802c-D0-3-pdis-v1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/802-c-drafts/d0/802c-D0-3-dis.pdf>

Roger Marks will prepare a new draft and recirculate it.

1600-1800, P802.1Qcn

Attendees: Pat Thaler, Glenn Parsons, Dan Romascanu, Yizhou Li, Lu Huang

Revision 0.1.1 has been reviewed and discussed.

Management: clause 17 MIB or YANG:

Discussion on what management should be in the draft. Add to the existing Clause 17 MIB or create a YANG module.

If in Clause 17, it would probably be additions to the 17.7.2 EVB MIB Modules including the EVB parameters and VSI data base.

However, we are doing this amendment to support IETF work on NVO3. That will use YANG management. SNMP management probably wouldn't be used by them. YANG would be more useful. Don't update Clause 17 MIB. Create a YANG module for VDP for NVO3.

Clause 40:

Agreed to add two new EVB modes rather than using current EVB Station and EVB Bridge. As EVB Mode is 2-bit field and 3 values have been used, use the remaining value to indicate non-EVB use of VDP. Use the two reserved bits in octet 11 to indicate tNVE or nNVE (and provide two reserved values) for this purpose.

Figure D-1 needs to be updated accordingly.

Clause 41:

Agreed to add IPv6 address related filter info.

Target to start task group ballot in July.

Security Task Group Minutes

The Security Task Group met on Monday, Tuesday and Wednesday (23-25 May).

The chair showed the Patent Policy and issued a call for patents at the beginning of each day's session. There were no responses to the call at this time.

P802.1AEcg (Ethernet Data Encryption Devices)

The IEEE 802.1AEcg WG ballot passed; a new draft 1.3 and proposed disposition of comments was distributed. Some comments were reviewed with the commenter(s). A WG recirculation ballot (draft 1.4) was issued from this meeting. A Sponsor Ballot is expected after the July Plenary. An IEEE 802.1AE Revision (rollup) is anticipated after this amendment is finalized; the editor will plan to propose a Revision project at a future Plenary meeting.

There was some discussion about backward compatibility based on concerns raised in ballot comments, in particular if IEEE 802.1AEcg would modify how MACsec works (Ericsson presentation uploaded). There was clarification and discussion – there shouldn't be an issue, as there were no EDEs prior (in IEEE 802.1AE-2006) and this does not add new functionality. If necessary, clarification of the scenario can be included.

P802.1ARce (Secure Device Identity: SHA-384 and P-384 Elliptic Curve)

The latest version of IEEE 802.1ARce is draft 0.7 from January 2015. It was agreed to send this for task group ballot with a request to look at the editor's comments, notes, and questions. Any and all comments to contribute to the text are welcome. It may make sense to change this project into a full revision rather than an amendment project. However, it would be good to try to settle as many items as possible from the issue list during the Task Group ballot first.

P802.1Xck - YANG Data Model for 802.1X

Marc Holness distributed a new draft (0.6) of IEEE 802.1Xck and stepped through it. There was some question about relation with LAG (Link Aggregation Group) members and the interface(s). The version with minor revisions (editorial notes) to create draft 0.6-1 was sent for Task Group ballot.

P802E Privacy Recommended Practice

Jerome Henry walked the group through the most recent version (draft 0.04). Rather than starting by addressing Personal Identifiable Information (PII), it was recommended that the document first focus on what is privacy, what types of devices are of interest for IEEE 802 (and what is the contribution from IEEE 802), overview of tracking and fingerprinting for example, then move into the PII discussion.

Brian Weis updated the group on the status of the privacy threat analysis (draft in progress). The end result is anticipated to be a summary of detailed threat analysis for the protocols of interest – with a proposed table of risk, threat, and threat analysis. He is looking at IEEE 802.1 protocols (i.e., IEEE 802.1Q, IEEE 802.1AB, IEEE 802.1X EAPOL, and IEEE 802.1AE frames), as well as IEEE 802.3, IEEE 802.11, and IEEE 802.15. Are there any other IEEE 802 protocols/WGs to consider for privacy impact?

Wifi Community extender over wired - use case

Philippe Klein presented on WiFi Community Range Extenders as a L2 Security Use Case. Privacy is definitely an issue. For a community WiFi, the access point provides a hotspot and local routing in the AP is turned off. A LAN is used to connect to the main WiFi gateway and a WiFi extender is in the home. It was suggested that there be a different security association between the extender and the gateway. This primarily separates the house users from others in the community; there is no separating the users within the house. It was generally agreed that this is going in the right direction and will be revisited at a future meeting.

A.O.B

There was also some discussion about vehicle security application(s).

Future teleconferences and meetings: teleconferences were scheduled for 28 June and 12 July 2016. The IEEE 802.1 Security and Privacy Task Group will meet at the July 2016 Plenary in San Diego, CA and the November 2016 Plenary in San Antonio, Texas.