

IEEE 802.1 Minutes, July 2005

Pre-Meeting Monday, July 18, 2005

IEEE 802.1ah Update Paul Bottorff

This presentation is at <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2005/ah-bottorff-updates-0705.pdf>

Reference model in the draft that has been debated

Need to get a consensus for the reference model so the draft can proceed

Check clause 23 since it has new material

There will be offline discussions this week to get the scope of the problem so Paul can create a new draft

Opening Plenary – Monday, July 18, 2005

Agenda – Tony Jeffree

Administrative stuff – 1

Officers and website

Administrative stuff -2

Voting membership rules are in the processing of being updated

Review of current membership rules

Administrative stuff -3

May need to create a formal policy and procedures for electing chair and vice-chair

Not clear that we need to do anything else but Tony will check to make sure

802.1 WG and TG Operations

.1 works by consensus not by Robert's rule

TG, WG, and Sponsor Ballots

A bit on how the ballot process works

Patent Policy

The required slides were shown to the committee and the policy was discussed

The committee was asked if anyone knows of patents and it was noted that this can be done offline

Inappropriate topics for IEEE WG meetings slide was discussed

Photography/recording devices & other techno toys

No use may be made of such devices

September Interim

France fell through

There is a possibility of New Hampshire with 802.3 Sept 12

Sacramento – week of 26th

Orange County with 802.11 – week of 18 -23

Straw Poll

20 Sacramento

16 New Hampshire

21 Irvine

Review of the Executive Committee Meeting

1600 attendees

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

ISO/SC6 & 802.11 – background about why IEEE went to ISO and history
Online training SoW for how IEEE 802 works
802.22 wants someone from 802.1 to discuss AM par
China meeting in Beijing about WAPI and 802.11
Rules changes – timeout of voting membership will be 3 plenaries and reduce the ability of folks to have voting in multiple working groups

Liaison reports

ITU – discussion of optical transports

IETF – will be cover later today

Task Group stuff

5 pars for consideration

Revision to 802.1ac par – MAC services

P802.1AL – Secure device identity

P802.1AM – wireless management

P802.1AO – Shortest path

P802.1AP – MIB especially 802.1Q

Other working groups must comment by 5 pm tomorrow

We must respond by 5 PM on Wednesday

11:30 AM Wednesday with 802.11 to discuss AM

Agenda – Mick Seaman

Monday

9.30-10.30 : P802.1ah Provider Backbone Bridges (Bottorff) [Hospitality]

1.00- 2.30 : 802.1 WG Opening Plenary [Hospitality]

Chair's opening remarks.

Agenda setting and confirmation for week.

Liaison statements etc.

3.00- 4.00 : IETF MIB persistence (Romascanu)

4.00- 5.00 : IETF liaison (Congdon)

- TRILL charter and 802.1 dependencies

- 802.1 MIB transfer

- Copyright transfer issue

- IETF transfer process document

- status of bridging MIBs

- ND Proxy review

- Radius Extensions 802 attributes WG last call

6.00- 7.30 Tutorial : A proposed secure device ID standard for 802 networks (Viega, Borza)

7.30- 9.00 Tutorial : An update on bridging technologies (Finn, Seaman)

Tuesday

9.00-10.30 : P802.1af Document structure, initial draft (Seaman) [Boardroom C]

11.00-12.30 : P802.1AE WG confirmation ballot resolution (Romanow)

9.00-12.30 : ITU-T SG13/15 updates (Hiroshi) [Hospitality]

P802.1ag CFM (Finn)

Loopback extensions (Dunbar)

GARP maintenance point registration (Sultan)

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

1.30- 3.00 : P802.1Q-REV sponsor ballot resolution (Jeffrey) Hospitality

3.30- 5.30 : P802.1ad sponsor ballot resolution (Haddock) [Hospitality]

Wednesday

9.00-11.00 : 802.3 liaison/technical plenary [Hospitality]

Frame Size Extension update, issues arising (Daines)

Congestion Management

Residential Ethernet

11.00-12.30 P802.1ah Provider Backbone Bridges, cont.(Bottorff) [Hospitality]

PBB Ethernet relay (Dunbar)

1.30- 4.00 PAR feedback and PAR updates: [Hospitality]

Device identity PAR (Borza, Viega)

Shortest path bridging (Finn, Seaman)

VLAN MIBs (Jeffrey, Congdon)

Media independent wireless management

4.00- 5.00 : Device identity, first draft planning (Borza, Viega) [Boardroom C]

4.00- 5.00 : Shortest path bridging, first draft planning (Seaman, Finn) [Hospitality]

Thursday

9.00-10.00 : P802.1ak MRP, task group ballot resolution (Jeffrey) [Hospitality]

9.00-10.00 : Media independent wireless management (Stefani) [Boardroom C]

11.00-12.00 : P802.1Q-REV sponsor ballot resolution cont.(Jeffrey) [Hospitality]

P802.1ad sponsor ballot resolution cont. (Haddock)

1.00- 2.00 : P802.1aj TMR, Two Port MAC Relay (Jeffrey) [Hospitality]

2:30- 5:00 : 802.1 WG Closing Plenary [Hospitality]

Finalize text of liaisons etc.

MIBS – Dan Romascanu

Discussion of how to persist MIB information

Discussion about which values should be persisted and how this affects a network on device startup

Dan will draft an email to IETF and let 802.1 review but it will not be a formal communications between IETF and 802.1

IETF and IEEE 802.1 Liaison – Paul Congdon

This is on the website at <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2005/liaison-ietf-congdon-0705.pdf>

TRILL

Bridge MIB overview

DNA link up review

ND Proxy review

Radius Extensions 802 attributes

TRILL

Review of what TRILL

Official working group

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

Bridge MIB transfer
Transfer Issues to document
Review of current issues to transfer the document
Device Now Available (DNA) link up review
Neighbor Discovery (ND)
Radius Extensions – 802 Attributes
RFC 3580

Tuesday AM, July 19, 2005

LinkSec met in parallel with Provider Networks

Review of P802.1af/D0.2 – Mick Seaman

Proposed that for awhile af is a replacement for x until we sort out what are the required changes. This will allow us to have a context for the changes and make the merge much easier to accomplish.

Need some contribution for figure 6-3 Access control processes

Ballot review of P802.1ae – Allyn Romanow

The official ballot resolution is on the web site

Tuesday PM, July 19, 2005

Ballot review of P802.1Q Rev – Tony Jeffree

The official ballot resolution is on the web site

Wednesday AM, July 20, 2005

Joint meeting with 802.3 to discuss several issues

Updates on Backward Congestion Notification – Davide Bergamasco

Proposal to improve expedited forwarding – Paul Congdon

Residential Applications – Mick Seaman

Residential Ethernet Objective Status and Questions – Michael Johas Teener

Status update of P802.3ar Congestion Management – Kevin Daines

Do you support P802.3ar TF objective #1 Limit rate of data transmission

Straw Poll

802.1 Y: 31 N: 2

Do you support Paul Congdon's May 2005 802.1 presentation as a component of congestion management?

Straw Poll

802.1 Y: 39 N: 0

Do you encourage the work and continued evaluation of Davide Bergamasco's 802.1 BCN presentation as a component of congestion management

Straw Poll

802.1 Y: 6 N: 2 Abstain: 31

After the break will be 802.1ah

This afternoon the PAR review may be very short so ballot comment review may start earlier

Provider Backbone Bridges – Paul Bottorff

Need a task force ballot to get a solid foundation

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

Review of the alternative architectures and the trade-offs. Paul needs contributions so a decision can be made about which one is the correct one to put in the standard

Wednesday PM, July 20, 2005

PAR Review – Tony Jeffree

PAR P802.1AC – MAC Service Definition

PAR P802.1AO – Shortest Path

Comment that AO should be different – make the standard P802.1AQ

PAR P802.1AP – Bridge MIBs

PAR P802.1AL – Secure Device Identity

Changed project to AR to avoid lower case L and one problem

PAR P802.1AM – Independent Wireless Management

One set of comments by 5 pm Tuesday, Bob Heile of P802.15, 802.22 said after the deadline that they are going to vote no on the PAR. P802.1 did not have an opportunity to address the issues that P802.22 raised

Discussion of the PAR versus creating a executive study group

There should be co-location of P802.1 and the wireless groups to provide better communications

Each of the wireless working groups can and should have voting representation in this working group

Need to go through the PAR and 5 criteria to make sure it is okay and post by 5 PM

P802.1ae Ballot Comment Review – Allyn Romanow

Thursday AM, July 21, 2005

Ballot Comment Review P802.1AK – Tony Jeffree

The official ballot disposition is kept on the P802.1 web site.

Thursday PM, July 21, 2005

TPMR discussion

A lot to be worked out on the management front.

Covered main issues but did not cover all of the draft

The next step is a task group ballot, which will allow further discussion.

Closing Plenary – Monday, July 21, 2005

See Tony's slides

Time scale for P & P – November will discuss

Recall Patents policy from the opening plenary

Future Meetings

802.1 Orange County, Hyatt in Garden Grove, fly into John Wayne Airport

Sacramento

Co-locate with .3

Plus have a one-day interim for residential Ethernet issues, separate from the regular .1 interim.

Need to acclimatize the Residential Ethernet, tutorial, workshop, will be in Bay Area.

1-2 days. Minimal notice – 30 days

Orange County decided, Sept. 26

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

Liaison – reply to ITU

Norm drafted a note to ITU-T SG13 Q5. About EtherType codes for Ethernet OAM. Saying no. No IEEE standard for filtering frames based on EtherType. There are commercial products. Bridges handle sub-types.

Review of Current PARs and PAR end dates

Q-rev- sponsor recirc, no outstanding negatives, finish this year

AC, – extend the PAR

Ad – sponsor recirc

AE – sponsor

.1af – not yet balloting

.1ag – next ballot WG or TG? Run another TG.

.ah – second draft is out, it's draft 1. Should go to Task group ballot.

.aj – TPMR – TG ballot

.ak MRP – TG ballot again

Four new PARs - .1AM, .1AP QMIB, .1aq shortest path, .1 ar device id

What are we going to do about

.11 and bridging – haven't done anything concrete on this at this meeting. Stalled waiting on .11. Had a good joint meeting at San Antonio, decided to do joint work. Holding pattern till someone says they want to do something.

ResE – we have a strategy

Congestion management – a new work item, no feedback that it should stop, needs more detail to convince people that it should be a work item.

Discussion about having a separate interim to socialize ResE.

Question about fixing the 64B-48B issue. What is happening? Answer, need to have a proposal to do work.

More discussion on the ResE interim. It's to help them come into 802.1. late sept, early October.

Discussion on .1AM PAR going to exec. It was argued that it would be inappropriate to base our vote on rumor from wireless groups, only one wireless group responded.

Motions

802.1 approves the March 2005 meeting minutes

Proposed: Romanow

Second: Finn

For: 23 Against: 1 Abstain: 1

802.1 resolves to hold an interim session in Orange County, week of 18th September

2005 hosted by the wireless groups

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Congdon

For: 22 Against: 1 Abstain: 1

802.1 resolves to hold an interim meeting, date and location to be decided, for the specific purpose of progressing work on “Residential Ethernet”

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Congdon

For: 16 Against: 2 Abstain: 9

802.1 resolves to hold a pre-meeting on the Monday morning of the November 2005 plenary session

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Romanow

For: 22 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Q-REV, Tony Jeffree, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: haddock

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 requests conditional approval from the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Q-REV to RevCom following completion of Sponsor balloting

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Haddock

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 instructs the editors of P802.1ad, Steve Haddock, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.

Proposed: Haddock

Second: Patton

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain

802.1 requests conditional approval from the SEC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1ad to RevCom following completion of Sponsor balloting

Proposed: Haddock

Second: Patton

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 instructs the editors for P802.1AE to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Working Group recirculation balloting.

Proposed: Romanow

Second: Finn

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

802.1 requests conditional approval from the SEC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1AE to Sponsor ballot following completion of Working Group balloting

Proposed: Romanow

Second: Finn

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1ag, Norm Finn, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: Finn Second: Messenger

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1ah, Paul Bottorff, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: Bottorff

Second: Sajassi

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 3

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aj, Tony Jeffree, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Mohan

For: 24 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1ak, Tony Jeffree, to prepare a further draft taking into account the discussions during the July 2005 meeting. The Chair is authorised to issue the draft for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Haddock

For: 24 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

802.1 requests permission from the EC to forward the P802.1AR Secure Device Identifier draft PAR to NesCom.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Congdon

For: 21 Against: 0 Abstain: 5

802.1 requests permission from the EC to forward the P802.1aq Shortest Path Bridging draft PAR to NesCom.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Finn

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 3

802.1 requests permission from the EC to forward the P802.1ap VLAN Bridge MIBs draft PAR to NesCom.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Congdon

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

802.1 requests permission from the EC to forward the P802.1AM Wireless Management draft PAR to NesCom.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Stefani

For: 13 Against: 3 Abstain: 9

802.1 requests permission from the EC to forward the revised P802.1AC MAC Service draft PAR to NesCom.

Proposed: Seaman

Second: Congdon

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 3

802.1 requests the Chair to forward the liaison response to Q5 SG13 as discussed during this meeting.

Proposed: Finn

Second: Congdon

For: 22 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

802.1 requests its Chair and liaisons to present the current working draft of P802.1ag to ITU-T Q5 SG13 and MEF.

Proposed: Finn

Second: Mohan

For: 20 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

Attendees:

Paul Amsden

Floyd Backes

Chester Balut

Edward Beili

Andras Bertsch

Bill Bjorkman

Mike Borza

Paul Bottorff

Rudolf Brandner

Jim Burns

Pat Calhoun

Dirceu Cavendish

Giulio Ceccarini

Rongfeng Chang

Frank Chao

Charles Chen

Jin Seek Choi

Jacob Christensen

Paul Congdon

Arjan de Heer

Linda Dunbar

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

Craig Easley
Kristian Ehlers
Anush Elangovan
Hesham Elbakoury
David Elie-Dit-Cosaque
Don Fedyk
Norm Finn
John Fuller
Ilango Ganga
Anoop Ghanwani
Ken Grewal
Tanmay Gupta
Steve Haddock
Takafumi Hamano
Asif Hazarika
Gopal Hegde
Walter Hurwitz
Romain Insler
Ran Ish-Shalom
Tony Jeffree
Pankaj Jha
Takeo Kanai
Daniel Kelley
Hormuzd Khosravi
Ajung Kim
Do Yeon Kim
Marc Kimpe
Mike Ko
Stephan Korsback
Aniruddha Kundu
Yannick Le Goff
Defeng Li
Pramodh Mallipatna
Dan Maltbie
David Martin
Tom Mathey
John Messenger
Dinesh Mohan
Bob Moskowitz
Satoshi Obara
Don O'Connor
Karen O'Donoghue
Bob O'hara
Hiroshi Ohta
John Osswald
Tim Paaske

July 2005

San Francisco, CA

Ae-soon Park
Glenn Parsons
Ken Patton
drew Perkins
Gideon Prat
Charles Qi
Ray Quin
Karen Randall
Yaron Raz
John Roese
Allyn Romanow
Dan Romascanu
Jessy V Rouyer
Sunesh Rustagi
Ali Sajassi
Sam Sambasivan
John Sauer
Peter Saunderson
Peter Schulter
Mick Seaman
Curtis Simonson
Matt Squire
Larry Stefani
Rajagopalan Subbian
Shingo Sugawara
Bob Sultan
Muneyoshi Suzuki
Francois Tallet
Manoj Wadekar
Ludwig Winkel
Jeff Wise
Michael D. Wright
Nimer Yaseen
Johnny Zweig