

802.1 Plenary Meeting, 3/11/96, 3:45 PM, LaJolla, Ca.

Items listed below did not necessarily proceed in the following order, However, they are listed in the order of the published agenda...)

Agenda:

1. Minutes: Slager
2. Documents: Keen
3. Voters and voting – Keen

January "non-meeting"; should it count toward 802.1 voting?

It was decided that the January un-official meeting would not count towards 802.1 attendance requirements. A building member expressed an objection to this. (It had been explicitly noted at the last plenary that it would be an unofficial meeting and would not count towards the attendance requirements.)

4. Task Group
 - a) Overview and Architecture
-

b) Internetworking (Mick Seaman)

802.1 Internetworking task Group - March 96

Objectives for this meeting:

802.1p traffic class & dynamic mcast filtering:

-Instructions to the Editor (Tony Jeffree) to provide 802.1p/D3 for the WG ballot after this meeting.

-Resolution of major technical issues at this meeting. Aim for resolution complete at next meeting and pass WG ballot on 802.1p/D4.

802.1Q VLANs

-Identify requirements/agreements for basic interoperability.

- Partition work into basic & advanced categories, identify obstacles to agreement on basic formats & forwarding rules.
 - Agree subject breakdown for progressing work.
 - Agree resolution of basic formats & forwarding rules.
 - Continue to share data & Understanding
 - Stimulate further contributions
 - Agree interim meeting?
-

802.1 Internetworking task Group - March 96

Agenda: March 96.

Tues 8-9:30 802.1p/D2 review

10-12 vLANs

- Media or network based vLANs (John Bartlett)
- Embedded vLAN tagging (John Bartlett)
- Two models for vLAN tagging (Norm Finn)
- ATM & vLANs (Krichna)

2-3 vLANs

3:30-5 vLAN breakouts

Wed -- technical plenary

10:30-12 vLAN breakout reports

2-3 vLAN breakout reports...

3:30- vLAN breakout, or 802.1p/D2

Thurs 9-10:30 vLAN basic interoperability

11-12 vLAN arch problem partitioning.

802.1p draft D3

Ballot ...

802.D reaffirmation

vLANs (802.1Q if approved)

c) Functional Requirements

Dormant
Interest?

5. Details for this meeting - Lidinsky (rooms..) --no parallel meetings.
(All 802.1p participants are also interested in vLANs.)
6. Minutes approval: Montreal meeting - Slager
***Motion: minutes approval, was made by John Hart, seconded by Robin Taker. No objections, 3 abstentions.
7. Executive Committee Report
Bill Lidinsky reported.
A count (30) was taken of those people who will very likely attend the next plenary meeting in Twente.
8. 802.1j/D5 and 802.1G - Lidinsky
Sponsor ballot -- not yet done...
The "log jam" seems to be over... this will proceed.
9. 802.1p/D2 (Tony Jeffree)
Draft status
Ballot status
10. 802/D22 (Alan Chambers)
Draft status - not done yet. target
(Changes were more difficult than first perceived.)
Ballot status - balloting will hopefully start soon after Easter.
11. Electronic Distribution of 802.1 Documents - Lidinsky
Almost all documents in machine readable form on ftp
Postscript
Text
802.1 WWW server - ?
.pdf documents (Adobe Acrobat) ---discussion (we will try this...)
12. Internetworking
13. Request for reserved multicast address for 802.3x
(See item 16....)
14. Patent Issue - Lidinsky

Ascom-timeplex / Xylan

I worked with IEEE and FNAL

IEEE property in my keeping

Attorney reviewed 802.1 files at my office and copied many (5 boxes)

15.Reaffirmation of Chair / Vice Chair

***Motion: Hal Keen moved for Bill Lidinsky's reaffirmation

Tony Jeffree seconded.

Objections: 0 / Abstentions: 0

***Motion: John Hart nominated Alan Chambers for Vice Chair/Tony Jeffree seconded.

23 for, 0 against, 0 abstentions

16.Reserved Multicast MAC address - Siefert (? 4:45...)

Document # 96/019 (Request for IEEE 802.1

Reserved Multicast Address Assignment)

***Motion: Made by John Hart, seconded by Tony Jeffree

-That 802.1 request a reserved multicast address from the block 01-

80-C2-00-00-01 to 01-80-C2-00-00-0F for 802.3x MAC Control

-That the actual value of the address assigned NOT be made public knowledge until 802.3x is forwarded for sponsor ballot (placeholders have been left in the draft standard).

-That the address selected NOT be 01-80-C2-00-00-04, as this hashes to the same bucket as the broadcast address with a popular family of controller ICs.

*** for: 25 / Against: 0 / Abstain: 0

17.802.3x Gigabit "Ethernet" PAR (? 5:00)

Presentation by Howard Frazier ... (Document 96/026, paper)

18.Newspaper Article -

"VLAN standards stymied by CISCO/IEEE squabble"

- Network world, 26 Feb., 1996

We should come up a press release from this plenary.

John Hart / Alan Chambers: Motion to adjourn. No objections.

DTR 11802-5 MAC Bridging of Ethernet V2.0,802.1H yes with comments*

DTR 8802-1 Overview of LANs - Tasker yes

*Comment: Ensure that the corrections in the IEEE correction sheet are applied to the published TR. (attachment 5)

***** Motion: Jeffree, second, Chin yes: 23 no: 0 abstain: 1

8. vLANs – Seaman

3 resolutions to affirm the work so far, record agreement and set direction.

1. Adopt an Architecture:
2. Intention to standardize a basic, one level or flat addressed, tag format.
3. Intention for future work on a complementary two level or hierarchical addressed tag format.

**** 802.1 Resolves:

- To adopt an architecture for vLANs which provides interoperability between different vLAN technologies (e.g., port based, address based, protocol based) and formats. (Such a range of techniques is required by the wide application space of vLANs.)

- The architecture specifically provides for effective interoperability between regions of the network in which the MAC addresses of frames are those of the communicating end stations (a flat addressing approach) and regions in which frames are addressed from switch to switch, for scalability to very large networks (a hierarchical addressing approach).

***** Moved: Hart Seconded: Wakerly yes: 32 no: 0 abstain: 1

***** Resolved

802.1 had achieved consensus on

The frame formats for 1-level addressing. They will be:

Enet/802.3 media

6 6 2 2

DA	SA	E-type	vLAN	...remainder of	new
	vLAN_1	ID		original frame	FCS

(includes E-type/length)

802.5 / FDDI Media

6 2 2

ACFC	DA	SA	Routing	SNAP-	E-Type	vLAN	...remainder of	new
			header	vLAN_1	ID		original frame	FCS

Token present (translated if original was
Ring if 802.3/Ethernet)
only RII=1

Moved: PJ Singh

Seconded: Floyd Backes yes:30 no:1 Abstain:2

Note: As it turns out, PJ is not a voting member (yet). This was not noted until after the meeting had adjourned, and as the proposal has the undeniable support of 802.1, the Motion stands as carried.

***** Resolved:

802.1 will support scalability to very large networks by developing the two-level addressing model provided for in the architecture.

Moved: Hart, Second:Chin yes:33 no:0 Abstain:1

9. MAC Bridging - Seaman

10. 802.1p/D2,D3 Traffic Class Expediting & Dynamic Multicast Filtering –
Jeffree

Tony Reported on the progress and the editorial instructions.

Attachments 1 & 2.

*** Motion: Tony Jeffree then made a motion to make the changes to draft 2 and then to ballot the resulting Draft 3 (projected finish date mid-April).

John Hart seconded it. 34 votes yes, 0 no, 0 abstain.

11. Revision / reaffirmation ballots needed - chambers

802.1d MAC Bridging updates: ballot following July meeting...

802.1E: ballot group being formed

12. Interim meeting

*** 802.1 resolves to hold an interim meeting on the subject of VLANs in the Boston area 4, 5, 6 June 1996

Moved: Seaman Seconded: Slager yes: 27 no: 0 abstain: 3

13. 802.1 electronic operation – Chambers

Discussion:

Server move to Unix system

Acrobat / PDF documents (we are going to try document distribution with PDFs... in addition to PS docs)

Web page (one of our own, or use SPA systems?)

14. Other Thursday night Exec items - Chambers

Discussion:

Other group's PARs

Book distribution

Expected attendance at Twente (20: sure, 40: sure or hopeful)

Future 802 meeting venues

Motion to Adjourn, Karl Shimada Second: Jeffree ... no objections

Attachment 1:

Status of: Draft Standard for Traffic Class and Dynamic Multicast

Filtering Services in Bridged Local Area Networks
P802.1p, March 14, 1996

HISTORY:

P802.1p/D1 published November 1995. D1 describes:

- 1) Filtering services in Bridged LANs;
- 2) Modifications to Forwarding Process to allow traffic class expediting based on multiple queues & extension of FDB to represent priority information;
- 3) Description of filtering services;
- 4) Initial cut at protocol definitions to provide filtering services;
- 5) Place-holder sections for management, performance annexes etc.

PROGRESS SINCE MONTREAL MEETING

Development of draft 2, including the following major changes:

- 1) Annexes added to describe design considerations and to record comment resolutions & issues list;
- 2) Re-development of GARP to simplify the state machines;
- 3) Treatment of registration by both "clients" and "servers".

ACTIONS DURING LA JOLLA MEETING:

- 1) Reviewed the revised document & issues;
- 2) Developed instructions to the Editor for revision of the document, to be followed by publication of P802.1p/D3 for initial 802.1 ballot in mid-April '96;
- 3) Adobe Acrobat PDF version of 802.1p/D2 generated; this will be made available (with readers) via the 802.1 FTP server after the meeting, as a pilot for distribution of D3.

Attachment 2:

INSTRUCTIONS TO THE EDITOR OF P802.1p

802.1 instructs the Editor of P802.1p, Tony Jeffree, to produce revision P802.1p/D3, based upon the following inputs:

- 1) Comments received during the La Jolla meeting with respect to the contents of P802.1p/D2 (see below);

2) Comments and contributions forwarded to the Editor via the 802.1 Email exploder, before end of March 1996;

3) Expansion by the Editor of section 6 (Bridge Management).

The major comments received on the document during the La Jolla meeting are as follows:

1) Need to add a definition of Group in section 1, and to fix the text in section 9 to make it clear that Group does not imply Group MAC address;

2) Service descriptions (2.6.7) to be clarified to distinguish between user services and management functions;

3) In 3.7, the Note needs modifying to clarify the distinction between consistency and conformance. Also, the Note is repeated in 3.7.5;

4) In 3.7.5, add a Note indicating that the de-queueing rules do not preclude the use of other rules;

5) In section 3, the use of FDB entry type names is inconsistent;

6) The text in section 9 should be further clarified to make the distinction between existence and membership (of a Group). Also need to fix the diagrams to illustrate that distinct state machines handle existence & membership;

7) Add definition in 9.6 for the use of : and * in the state diagrams;

8) Find more appropriate names for the ATTEMPT LEAVE states in 9.6.2;

9) Fix bit ordering ambiguity in the text of 9.8.1.1 & 9.8.2.7;

10) Fix the examples in Annex H to match the state machine descriptions;

11) Fix Issue 3 by mentioning the implications of registering unicast addresses (scaling, single priority per address);

12) Change priority processing in line with John Grinham's proposal (give precedence to statically configured priority values);

13) Change LSAP to LLC Address in 9.4 b);

14) Add discussion in an Annex of the implications of mixed mode LANs (old/new Bridges);

15) Modify the description of static/dynamic entries to make it clear that there is a single entry which has permanent and volatile elements;

16) Need discussion in an Annex of the requirements for interoperability with other higher layer multicast protocols, e.g., IGMP, and the consequent implementation constraints;

17) Assorted typos and other minor corrections, e.g., as identified

in David Addison's contribution.

The revised draft will be circulated for 802.1 letter ballot via the 802.1 FTP server, in PDF and PostScript formats, by mid-April 1996.

MOVED: Jeffree SECONDED: Hart

For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

Attachment 3: list of voting membership as of 3/14/96

802.1 voting members, March, 1996

name	Address	Org	
Floyd	Backes	3Com	floyd_backes@3mail.3com.com
Avner	Ben-Dor		
John	Boal		
David	Brady	Bay Networks	dbrady@baynetworks.com
Laura	Bridge	3Com	
Jeffrey	Catlin		
Alan	Chambers		
Steve	Chan		
Hon Wah	Chin	Cisco	hwc@cisco.com
Steve	Cooper		
Paul	Cowell		
Andy	Davis		
J.J.	Ekstrom	U B	Jekstrom@UB.com
Paul	Frantz	Bay Networks	pFranz@baynetworks.com
John	Grinham		
Steve	Haddock	Network Peripherals	shaddock@npix.com
John	Hart	3Com	John_Hart@3mail.3com.com
Steve	Horowitz	3Com	Witz@chipcom.com
Tony	Jeffree	consultant	100271.522@compuserve.com
Jan-Olaf	Jemmeno		

Hal Keen
Keith Klamm
Paul Lachapelle Cabletron paul@ctron.com
Paul Langille Ascom Nexion langille@nexen.com
Bill Lidinsky
Martin McNealis Cisco
Jorg Ottensmeyer
Luc Pariseau
Yonadav Perry
Brian Phillips
Anil Rijsinghani Digital netcad.enet.dec.com
Mick Seaman 3com mick_seaman@3com.com
Lee Sendelbach IBM
Himanshu Shah
K. Karl Shimada Rising Star Research kkarl@netcom.com
C. Fred Shu
Rosemary Slager IBM rvslager@vnet.ibm.com
Richard Sweatt
Robin Tasker
Dono van-Mierop
John Wakerly Alantec wakerly@alantec
Peter Wang
Philip Wang
Michael D. Wright
Michele Wright Xylan mwright@xylan.com
Wayne Zakowski

attachment 4:

text of a Letter from ATM forum / 802.1 response

To: IEEE P802.1

From: ATM Forum Technical Committee, LAN Emulation Working Group

Subject: QoS, VLANs, & Multicast Support

As its December, 1995 meeting in London, the LAN Emulation WG added support for QoS and enhanced multicast support to its list of requirements for LANE V2.

The LANE WG is aware that P802.1 is also doing work in the area, particularly 802.1p and support for QoS. We also expect that 802.1's work on VLANs is closely related to this activity.

The LANE WG requests IEEE 802.1 to forward for information, appropriate documents (e.g. current drafts, requirements documents, etc.). Further, the LANE WG requests IEEE 802 to appoint a liaison, such individual to present a tutorial on the above subjects to the ATM Forum Technical Committee at its April 1996 meeting in Anchorage, Alaska or sooner. We attach the latest agreed upon version of the LANE v2.0 requirements for your information.

Attachment

<include /atm/contributions/atm95/atm95-0259r7.ps from atmforum.com>

-----end of letter ---

802.1 resolves to send:

802.1p

Copies of LaJolla Resolutions

VLAN PAR

Floyd Backes

& requests -current MPOA Baseline text.

-LANE v2

-a tutorial on MPOA & LANE in Enschede.

Moved: Robin Tasker Second: R.Sliger yes: 30 No: 0 Abstain: 0

attachment 5: text of letter with corrections for IEEE std 802.1H...

To: Kathy Doty
From: Alan Chambers

Subject: Corrections for IEEE std 802.1H-1995
Date: March 14, 1996

The following are the corrections needed for 802.1H. Can you apply them to the IEEE master text and generate the Correction Sheet for publication; then just to make sure (!) please send / fax the finished Correction Sheet to me and Hal Keen for checking, before issuing it generally.

Thank you,

sincerely,

Alan M Chambers.

IEEE Std 802.1H-1995

Correction Sheet

Issued ... 1996

Attached are corrected pages 8 and 14. The following corrections have been made:

Page 8, figure 6 row labeled "IEEE 802.3 MAC frame RFC1042-encoded", third column, The entry should read "IEEE 802 MAC frame, RC 1042 encoded (SNAP OUI 00-00-00)" rather than "... tunnel-encoded ... 00-00-F8)" |

Page 8, figure 6, notes a and b. The designations "Bridge 1" and

"Bridge 2" should be interchanged; and "needs to match" in each note should read "matches".

Page 14, first line. "IEEE 802.3 LLC addresses" should read "IEEE 802.2 LLC addresses".
